

City Council

Monday 27 June 2016

PRESENT:

Councillor Murphy, in the Chair

Councillor Sam Davey, Vice Chair

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowie, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bridgeman, Carson, Churchill, Coker, Cook, Darcy, Philippa Davey, Downie, Drean, Evans, Fletcher, K Foster, Mrs Foster, Fry, Hendy, James, Jordan, Kelly, Martin Leaves, Michael Leaves, Sam Leaves, Loveridge, Lowry, Dr Mahony, Mavin, McDonald, Morris, Nicholson, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Ricketts, Riley, Singh, Smith, Sparling, Stevens, Storer, Jon Taylor, Kate Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Wigans and Winter.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Dann and Parker-Delaz-Ajete

Also in attendance: Tracey Lee (Chief Executive), David Shepperd (Head of Legal Services), Judith Shore (Democratic and Member Services Manager) and Amelia Boulter (Senior Democratic Support Officer (Cabinet).

The meeting started at 4.00 pm and finished at 7.00 pm.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

11. Announcements

The Lord Mayor would not normally make announcements at a special meeting of Council. However, this was the first time Council had met since recent tragic events and the Lord Mayor spoke about the following:

- (a) Orlando - referred to the tragic events which took place in Orlando on Sunday 12 June 2016
- (b) Jo Cox, MP - referred to the senseless murder of Jo Cox, MP for Batley and Spen, on 16 June 2016.
- (c) Honorary Alderman and former Deputy Lord Mayor and Councillor, Mrs Connie Pascoe - reported that Mrs Connie Pascoe had recently passed away on 8 June 2016.
- (d) Tunisia Terror Attack - first anniversary - reported that a national one-minute silence was held today at noon.
- (e) Battle of the Somme - advised there would be a 2-minute national silence at 7.28 am on Friday 1 July 2016, for the 100th Anniversary

The Council stood in silence as a mark of respect and reflection for these events.

12. **Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest made by members.

13. **Changes to the composition and delivery of the council's overview and scrutiny function**

This report followed the decision to defer appointments to the scrutiny function made at the Annual General Meeting of the Council on 20 May 2016 and recommendations made by the Co-operative Scrutiny Board (CSB) on 9 March 2016.

Councillor Bowyer (Leader) proposed and Councillor James seconded the recommendations in the Council report, which included the adoption a two committee system of scrutiny (Appendix Ai, Option B, of the CSB report).

An amendment was proposed by Councillor Mrs Aspinall and seconded by Councillor Evans as follows –

Delete recommendation 11 and insert –

A timetable of meetings to be to be agreed by the Chair and Vice Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee in consultation with the Monitoring Officer and published once agreed.

Following a vote the amendment was agreed unanimously.

A debate took place on recommendation 16 of the CSB report and the CSB minutes of 9 March 2016 - it was queried why recommendation 16 had been omitted from the Leader's recommendations.

The meeting adjourned for 15 minutes to seek clarification.

After the meeting had been reconvened, David Shepherd, Head of Legal Services, confirmed that CSB recommendation 16 had not been omitted; it was included at recommendation 7 of the Council report - the the Leader had based his recommendations on the recommendations made by the CSB, but they were not identical.

The debate on the recommendations, as amended, continued and Councillor Mrs Pengelly put forward a closure motion (that the vote was taken immediately) which was seconded by Councillor Darcy.

Following a vote the closure motion was agreed.

Councillor Bowyer summed up and a vote was taken on recommendations 1, 2, 3, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11 of the Council report.

Following a vote the motion was carried and the following was agreed:

- I. Recommendations 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 and 17 of the CSB report (Appendix A). The Lead Scrutiny Officer is directed to implement accordingly

2. Recommendation 1 (Appendix A), implement Option B (Appendix A, i) as the recommended course of action to establish strong community involvement in the scrutiny function, retain oversight of executive decision making and reduce overall costs of the function
3. Name the two committees the Place and Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee
7. Recommendation 16 of the CSB report: ensure that paperless solutions are available for all Members through the Modern Government project currently within the change management pipeline
8. Changes to the constitution as outlined in Appendices B and C of the report and the Monitoring Officer is instructed to implement all resultant and necessary administrative changes to the constitution
9. Recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel (22 June 2016) on levels of Special Responsibility Allowances payable to scrutiny members in the new structure (Appendix F)
10. Recommendation 8 (Appendix A of the CSB report) and establish a £10,000 training and development fund resourced from savings made in Special Responsibility Allowances
11. The Chair and Vice Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Committees to agree a timetable of meetings, in consultation with the Monitoring Officer; to be published once agreed.

Following approval of the above, recommendations 4, 5 and 6 were agreed as follows:

4. Appoint members from the largest minority group as Chairs and members of the ruling group as Vice-Chairs of the Overview and Scrutiny Committees and enshrine this within the constitution (CSB recommendation 7)
5. Appoint 9 further members to the Place and Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee
6. Appoint 9 further members to the Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Nominations for Place and Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee and Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee were submitted from the Labour Group –

Place and Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee	Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Councillor Bowie (Chair)	Councillor Mrs Aspinall (Chair)
Councillor Mavin	Councillor Dann
Councillor Morris	Councillor Tuohy
Councillor Penberthy	Councillor McDonald
Councillor Sam Davey	Councillor Tuffin

The Conservative Group deferred their committee nominations to the next meeting of Full Council on 11 July 2016.

14. **Changes to the governance arrangements of the Council**

Councillor Riley (Cabinet Member for Democracy and Governance) proposed and Councillor Bowyer seconded the recommendations on the changes to the governance arrangements of the Council.

The report included recommendations to implement a committee form of governance from the Annual General Meeting in May 2017, subject to detailed proposals being put before Council before the implementation date.

An amendment was proposed by Councillor Stevens and seconded by Councillor Evans as follows –

To amend recommendation 3 –

After ‘considered’ insert ‘and only implemented following a positive vote’.

Following the vote, the amendment was agreed unanimously.

A further amendment was moved by Councillor Stevens and seconded by Councillor Evans as follows –

To add an additional resolution –

‘4. The proposals shall be based on meaningful consultation with the public and principal partners and stakeholders.’

Following the vote the amendment was agreed unanimously.

A further amendment was moved by Councillor Stevens and seconded by Councillor Evans as follows –

To add an additional resolution 4 or 5 as appropriate –

‘The work of the Constitution, Civic and Councillor Development Working Group, referred to above in 3, be chaired and co-ordinated by a politically independent non-Councillor/non Council employee recommended by the Monitoring Officer and agreed by the Constitution, Civic and Councillor Development Working Group.’

(The Lord Mayor left the meeting to attend an engagement and the Deputy Lord Mayor took the Chair until the end of the meeting. With the agreement of Council, Councillor Bowie acted as Vice-Chair until the end of the meeting.)

Following debate, a vote was taken and the amendment was lost.

The debate on the recommendations, as amended, continued.

Councillor Darcy then put forward a closure motion (that the vote was taken immediately) which was seconded by Councillor Mrs Beer and agreed.

Councillor Riley summed up, a vote was taken on the recommendations as amended, and Council agreed to –

1. In principle, to change the Council's governance arrangements and start to operate a committee system form of governance.
2. That the relevant change time for Plymouth City Council to cease operating the existing form of governance and start operating the new committee form of governance shall be at its Annual General Meeting in May 2017.
3. To request the Constitution, Civic and Councillor Development Working Group to work up detailed proposals for the operation of the committee system, to be considered, and only implemented following a positive vote, at the March 2017 full Council meeting, in advance of the May 2017 implementation date.
4. The proposals shall be based on meaningful consultation with the public and principal partners and stakeholders.